

NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION

Division of Air Resources

625 Broadway, Albany, New York 12233-3250

P: (518) 402-8452 | F: (518) 402-9035

www.dec.ny.gov

Ms. Lisa F. Garcia
Regional Administrator
United States Environmental Protection Agency
Region 2
290 Broadway
New York, New York 10007-1866

December 26, 2024

Dear Administrator Garcia:

On June 2, 2010 the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) strengthened the primary (health based) SO₂ National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS) by establishing a new 1-hour standard at a level of 75 parts per billion (ppb).

EPA finalized the second round of designations for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS on July 12, 2016. In that final rule, EPA designated Erie and Niagara Counties in New York State as “unclassifiable/attainment” for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS based on an assessment and characterization of air quality performed using air dispersion modeling software, i.e., AERMOD, analyzing actual emissions in the area surrounding Huntley (Erie County) and Somerset (Niagara County) generating stations, and other nearby sources which may have a potential impact in the area of analysis where maximum concentrations of SO₂ are expected.

EPA finalized the third round of designations for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS on January 1, 2018. In that final rule, EPA designated Albany, Orange, Suffolk, New York, Queens, Kings, Bronx, and Richmond counties in New York State as “unclassifiable/attainment” for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS based on an assessment and characterization of air quality in the area surrounding Lafarge Building Materials (Albany County), Roseton Generating Station (Orange County), Northport Power Station (Suffolk County), and the New York City area due to several power stations. The assessment and characterization were performed using air dispersion modeling software, i.e., AERMOD, that analyzed actual emissions from these sources and included other nearby sources which may have a potential impact in the area of analysis where maximum concentrations of SO₂ are expected.

Pursuant to 40 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) 51.1205(b), “[f]or any area where modeling of actual SO₂ emissions serve as the basis for designating such area as attainment for the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS, the air agency shall submit an annual report to the EPA Regional Administrator ... that documents the annual SO₂ emissions of each applicable source in each such area and provides an assessment of the cause of any emissions increase from the previous year.”

This submittal includes a report entitled “40 CFR 51.1205(b) Report; Albany, Bronx, Erie, Kings, New York, Niagara, Orange, Queens, Richmond, and Suffolk Counties; Sulfur Dioxide 2010 Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard; November 2024” and the Public Notice published in the November 13, 2024 *Environmental Notice Bulletin*. No comments were received during the public comment period that ended on December 13, 2024.

The report satisfies the submittal requirements of 40 CFR 51.1205(b) for 2024, and concludes that Albany, Bronx, Erie, Kings, New York, Niagara, Orange, Queens, Richmond, and Suffolk Counties continue to attain the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS and recommends that no additional modeling is needed to satisfy the requirements of 40 CFR 51.1205(b).

Should you have any questions regarding this submission, please do not hesitate to contact Mr. Daniel Goss, Assistant Engineer, SIP Planning Section, Division of Air Resources at (518) 402-8396.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Christopher LaLone", is centered below the text "Sincerely,".

Christopher LaLone, PE
Director
Division of Air Resources

Enclosures

c: R. Bielawa
D. Goss
R. Ruvo, EPA R2



Department of
Environmental
Conservation

40 CFR 51.1205(b) Report

2010 Sulfur Dioxide

National Ambient Air Quality Standard

**ALBANY, BRONX, ERIE, KINGS, NEW YORK, NIAGARA, ORANGE,
QUEENS, RICHMOND, AND SUFFOLK COUNTIES**

NOVEMBER 2024

DIVISION OF AIR RESOURCES

BUREAU OF AIR QUALITY PLANNING

ALBANY, NEW YORK 12233-3251

P: (518) 402-8396 | F: (518) 402-9035 | DAR.SIPS@DEC.NY.GOV

Table of Contents

Introduction and Background	1
Annual SO ₂ Emissions	3
Albany County	4
Bronx County	6
Erie County	7
Kings County	8
New York County	9
Niagara County	10
Orange County	11
Queens County	12
Richmond County	13
Suffolk County	14
Monitoring Data	15
Recommendation	16
Conclusion	16

Introduction and Background

On June 2, 2010, the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA, or Agency) strengthened the primary (health based) sulfur dioxide (SO₂) National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS) by establishing a new 1-hour standard at a level of 75 parts per billion (ppb) that is attained when the 3-year average of the 99th percentile of 1-hour daily maximum concentrations does not exceed 75 ppb. The secondary (welfare based) SO₂ standard of 500 ppb evaluated over 3 hours was not revised.

Pursuant to 40 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) 51.1205(b), “[f]or any area where modeling of actual SO₂ emissions serve as the basis for designating such area as attainment for the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS, the air agency shall submit an annual report to the EPA Regional Administrator by July 1 of each year, either as a stand-alone document made available for public inspection, or as an appendix to its Annual Monitoring Network Plan (also due on July 1 each year under 40 CFR 58.10), that documents the annual SO₂ emissions of each applicable source in each such area and provides an assessment of the cause of any emissions increase from the previous year. The first report for each such area is due by July 1 of the calendar year after the effective date of the area’s initial designation.

(1) The air agency shall include in such report a recommendation regarding whether additional modeling is needed to characterize air quality in any area to determine whether the area meets or does not meet the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS. The EPA Regional Administrator will consider the emissions report and air agency recommendation and may require that the air agency conduct updated air quality modeling for the area and submit it to the EPA within 12 months.

(2) An air agency will no longer be subject to the requirements of this paragraph (b) for a particular area if it provides air quality modeling demonstrating that air quality values at all receptors in the analysis are no greater than 50 percent of the 1-hour SO₂ NAAQS, and such demonstration is approved by the EPA Regional Administrator.”

EPA finalized the second round of designations for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS on July 12, 2016.¹ In that final rule, EPA designated the New York counties of Erie and Niagara Counties as “unclassifiable/attainment” for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS. The designation was based on an assessment and characterization of air quality in the area surrounding Huntley Generating Station (Erie County), Somerset Generating Station (Niagara County), and other nearby sources that had a potential to negatively impact the area where maximum concentrations of SO₂ could occur.

¹ 81 FR 45039; July 12, 2016; <https://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/2016FR-2016-07-12/pdf/2016-16348.pdf>. See also <https://www.epa.gov/sulfur-dioxide-designations/so2-designations-round-2-new-york-state-recommendation-and-epa-response> (additional background information).

EPA finalized the third round of designations for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS on January 1, 2018.² In that final rule, EPA designated Albany, Orange, Suffolk, New York, Queens, Kings, Bronx, and Richmond counties in New York State as “unclassifiable/attainment” for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS. These designations were based on an assessment and characterization of air quality in the areas surrounding Lafarge Building Materials (Albany County), Roseton Generating Station (Orange County), Northport Power Station (Suffolk County), several power stations in the New York City metropolitan area, and other nearby sources that had a potential to negatively impact the area where maximum concentrations of SO₂ could occur.

This “40 CFR 51.1205(b) Report” satisfies the annual reporting requirements for July 1, 2024.

² 83 FR 1098; January 1, 2018; <https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2018/01/09/2017-28423/air-quality-designations-for-the-2010-sulfur-dioxide-so2>.

Annual SO₂ Emissions

This report includes SO₂ emissions for 2020, 2021, 2022, and 2023 from the following sources specifically identified in the second and third rounds of designations by EPA as needing to be documented:

- Lafarge Building Materials (Albany County),
- Huntley Steam Generating Station (Erie County),
- Consolidated Edison – 59th Street Station (New York County),
- Consolidated Edison – 74th Street Station (New York County),
- Consolidated Edison – East River Generating Station (New York County),
- Somerset Operating Company LLC (Niagara County),
- Roseton Generating Station (Orange County),
- Astoria Generating Station (Queens County),
- Ravenswood Generating Station (Queens County), and
- Northport Power Station (Suffolk County).

This report also includes SO₂ emissions for 2020, 2021, 2022, and 2023 from other sources that emitted more than 40 tons of SO₂ in any of these years because of their potential impact on areas where maximum concentrations of SO₂ could occur.

Albany County

Table 1: Annual SO₂ Emissions (tons): Albany County Sources

Facility name	2020*	2021*	2022*	2023*
Holcim US Inc. (formerly Lafarge Building Materials)	58.71	44.00	56.59	77.32
Norlite LLC	75.09	125.71	113.01	3.23
Innovative / Colonie	17.02	37.19	45.41	14.46
County Total (includes emissions from all facilities in the county)	226.61	269.27	276.98	142.82

*Source: Certified actual annual non-exempt emissions reported by each facility pursuant to 6 NYCRR Subpart 202-2, "Emission Statements." All 2023 Emission Statements for Albany County are Technically Complete (processed by the Department and emissions are recorded in DEC's Air Facility System database).

EPA designated Albany County as "unclassifiable/attainment" based on the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation's (DEC's) "Revised Designation Recommendation for Sulfur Dioxide; Statewide (With the Exception of Erie, Niagara, Seneca, St. Lawrence, and Tompkins Counties); 2010 Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard; January 2017"³ that included dispersion modeling based on Lafarge Building Material's (now Holcim US Inc.) actual SO₂ emissions of 5,418 tons in 2013; 4,582 tons in 2014; and 4,806 tons in 2015.

Annual SO₂ emissions from Holcim have decreased significantly because its state-of-the-art facility that began operating in late 2017 incorporates modern burn technology (a pre-calciner with a dry kiln) and other emission control systems that have greatly reduced emissions. Holcim emitted 77.32 tons of SO₂ in 2023, amounts significantly below the emissions used by EPA in designating Albany County "unclassifiable/attainment."

Innovative Colonie, a landfill gas to electric generation facility, has seen increasing amounts of SO₂ emissions in the last three years. Their emissions in 2022 exceeded the 40-ton major source threshold for inclusion in this report. However, emissions in 2023 were much lower, only 14.46 tons.

Overall, total annual SO₂ emissions in Albany County decreased by 134.16 tons from 2022 to 2023. This represents a 48% decrease year-over-year. Most of the decrease was due to the Norlite facility, which paused operations mid-way through 2023. Total annual SO₂ emissions were 97.2% less than the three-year average of emissions (5,168.48 tons) used by EPA to designate the county as unclassifiable/attainment. Consequently, additional modeling is not needed to characterize air quality in Albany

³ Available on Request

County to determine whether the area meets or does not meet the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS.

Bronx County

Table 2: Annual SO₂ Emissions (tons): Bronx County Sources

Facility name	2020*	2021*	2022*	2023*
No facilities emitted greater than 40 tons per year in 2023	-	-	-	-
County Total (includes emissions from all facilities in the county)	5.36	3.90	11.24	8.47

*Source: Certified actual annual non-exempt emissions reported by each facility pursuant to 6 NYCRR Subpart 202-2, "Emission Statements." All 2023 Emission Statements for Bronx County are Technically Complete.

There were no facilities in Bronx County in 2023 that are expected to contribute to or cause SO₂ nonattainment in the future.

EPA designated Bronx County as "unclassifiable/attainment" based on DEC's "Revised Designation Recommendation for Sulfur Dioxide; Statewide (With the Exception of Erie, Niagara, Seneca, St. Lawrence and Tompkins Counties); 2010 Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard; January 2017" that included dispersion modeling based on county-wide SO₂ emissions of 80 tons in 2013; 92 tons in 2014; and 119 tons in 2015.

Emissions decreased from 2022 to 2023 by 2.78 tons, a 25% decrease. Additionally, emissions of SO₂ in 2023 were still 91.3% less than the three-year average of emissions (97.64 tons) used by EPA to designate the county as unclassifiable/attainment.

Consequently, additional modeling is not needed to characterize air quality in Bronx County to determine whether the area meets or does not meet the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS.

Erie County

Table 3: Annual SO₂ Emissions (tons): Erie County Sources

Facility name	2020*	2021*	2022*	2023*
PVS Chemical Solutions Inc.	82.97	47.96	9.98	7.75
Chaffee Landfill	36.99	9.58	44.31	41.34
3M Tonawanda	51.39	46.50	40.21	42.92
County Total (includes emissions from all facilities in the county)	177.69	112.37	99.37	95.61

*Source: Certified actual annual emissions reported by each facility pursuant to 6 NYCRR Subpart 202-2, "Emission Statements." All 2023 Emission Statements for Erie County are Technically Complete.

EPA designated Erie County as "unclassifiable/attainment" based on DEC's "Revised Designation Recommendation for Sulfur Dioxide; Buffalo-Cheektowaga, NY CSA; 2010 Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard; September 2015"⁴ that included dispersion modeling based on Huntley Steam Generating Station's actual SO₂ emissions of 4,316 tons in 2011; 2,715 tons in 2012 and 3,218 tons in 2013. Huntley surrendered their Title V Air Permit on April 12, 2019.

Emissions in Erie County have continued to decline over the last four years. Total annual SO₂ emissions in Erie County decreased by 3.76 tons from 2022 to 2023. Emissions are 97.2% less than the three-year average of emissions (3,416 tons) used by EPA to designate the county as unclassifiable/attainment.

Consequently, EPA does not need to take any action pursuant to 40 CFR 51.1205(d) for Erie County.

⁴ Available on Request

Kings County

Table 4: Annual SO₂ Emissions (tons): Kings County Sources

Facility name	2020*	2021*	2022*	2023*
No facilities emitted greater than 40 tons per year in 2023	-	-		-
County Total (includes emissions from all facilities in the county)	29.64	34.84	35.79	40.77

*Source: Certified actual annual non-exempt emissions reported by each facility pursuant to 6 NYCRR Subpart 202-2, "Emission Statements." All 2023 Emission Statements for Kings County are Technically Complete, except DECID 2-6101-00042. For the purposes of this report, emissions from this facility were assumed to stay constant at 0.21 tons.

There were no facilities in Kings County in 2023 that are expected to contribute to or cause SO₂ nonattainment in the future.

EPA designated Kings County as "unclassifiable/attainment" based on DEC's "Revised Designation Recommendation for Sulfur Dioxide; Statewide (With the Exception of Erie, Niagara, Seneca, St. Lawrence and Tompkins Counties); 2010 Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard; January 2017" that included dispersion modeling based on county-wide SO₂ emissions of 40 tons in 2013; 75 tons in 2014; and 83 tons in 2015.

Emissions have increased over the last four years but have remained relatively consistent. Emissions of SO₂ in 2023 increased by 4.98 tons but are still 39% less than the three-year average of emissions (65.97 tons) used by EPA to designate the county as unclassifiable/attainment.

Consequently, additional modeling is not needed to characterize air quality in Kings County to determine whether the area meets or does not meet the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS.

New York County

Table 5: Annual SO₂ Emissions (tons): New York County Sources

Facility name	2020*	2021*	2022*	2023*
Con-Ed East River Generating Station	17.58	15.08	63.37	25.97
Con-Ed 74th Street Station	6.41	11.69	74.45	2.99
Con-Ed 59th Street Station	1.04	1.44	3.51	1.04
County Total (includes emissions from all facilities in the county)	33.17	37.40	156.53	42.74

*Source: Certified actual annual non-exempt emissions reported by each facility pursuant to 6 NYCRR Subpart 202-2, "Emission Statements." All 2023 Emission Statements for New York County are Technically Complete.

SO₂ emissions from Con Ed-East River Generating Station, Con Ed-74th Street Station and Con Ed-59th Street increased significantly in 2022 by burning more fuel oil instead of natural gas to meet consumer electric demand. In 2023, emissions from these power plants have returned to historical levels.

EPA designated New York County as "unclassifiable/attainment" based on DEC's "Revised Designation Recommendation for Sulfur Dioxide; Statewide (With the Exception of Erie, Niagara, Seneca, St. Lawrence and Tompkins Counties); 2010 Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard; January 2017" that included dispersion modeling based on county-wide SO₂ emissions of 684 tons in 2013; 481 tons in 2014; and 370 tons in 2015.

Total annual SO₂ emissions in New York County in 2023 declined by 113.79 tons and were 92% less than the three-year average of emissions (509.97 tons) used by EPA to designate the county as unclassifiable/attainment.

Consequently, additional modeling is not needed to characterize air quality in New York County to determine whether the area meets or does not meet the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS.

Niagara County

Table 6: Annual SO₂ Emissions (tons): Niagara County Sources

Facility name	2020*	2021*	2022*	2023*
Somerset Operating Company LLC	460.40	0.00	0.00	0.00
Allied Waste		94.75	82.14	81.65
Reworld Niagara I, LLC (fka Covanta)	112.40	55.17	83.73	84.71
County Total (includes emissions from all facilities in the county)	596.71	83.42	190.42	190.96

*Source: Certified actual annual non-exempt emissions reported by each facility pursuant to 6 NYCRR Subpart 202-2, "Emission Statements." All 2023 Emission Statements for Niagara County are Technically Complete.

SO₂ emissions from Somerset Operating Company LLC decreased by 489.14 tons from 2020 to 2021 because the facility officially ceased operations on March 31, 2020. The facility has not yet surrendered its Title V permit because it contains nuisance dust requirements that demolition contractors must comply with.

EPA designated Niagara County as "unclassifiable/attainment" based on DEC's "Revised Designation Recommendation for Sulfur Dioxide; Buffalo-Cheektowaga, NY CSA; 2010 Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard; September 2015" that included dispersion modeling based on Somerset's actual SO₂ emissions of 10,024 tons in 2011; 5,653 tons in 2012 and 5,723 tons in 2013.

Total annual SO₂ emissions in Niagara County remained constant from 2022 to 2023 and were 97.3% less than the three-year average of emissions (7,133.33 tons) used by EPA to designate the county as unclassifiable/attainment.

Consequently, additional modeling is not needed to characterize air quality in Niagara County to determine whether the area meets or does not meet the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS.

Orange County

Table 7: Annual SO₂ Emissions (tons): Orange County Sources

Facility name	2020*	2021*	2022*	2023*
Roseton Generating Station	10.22	27.42	751.04	106.48
CPV Valley Energy Center	9.77	8.97	10.03	9.13
County Total (includes emissions from all facilities in the county)	22.26	42.61	769.73	126.75

*Source: Certified actual annual non-exempt emissions reported by each facility pursuant to 6 NYCRR Subpart 202-2, "Emission Statements." All 2023 Emission Statements for Orange County are Technically Complete.

Annual SO₂ emissions from Roseton Generating Station decreased by 4.80 tons from 2019 to 2020 and increased by 17.20 tons from 2020 to 2021 primarily due to economics and variation in how much they are called on to operate during the year. Emissions at Roseton in 2022 increased dramatically due to lack of availability of pipeline natural gas during the extreme cold events that took place in February 2023. This forced the facility to burn much more #6 oil than in the previous two years.

The burning of fuel oil at Roseton is the primary source of SO₂ emissions in the county. Fuel oil use decreased from 18.7 million gallons in 2022 to 2.5 million gallons in 2023.

EPA designated Orange County as "unclassifiable/attainment" based on DEC's "Revised Designation Recommendation for Sulfur Dioxide; Statewide (With the Exception of Erie, Niagara, Seneca, St. Lawrence and Tompkins Counties); 2010 Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard; January 2017" that included dispersion modeling based on county-wide SO₂ emissions of 120 tons in 2013; 608 tons in 2014; and 608 tons in 2015.

Total annual SO₂ emissions in Orange County in 2023 were 77% less than the three-year average of emissions (558.53 tons) used by EPA to designate the county as unclassifiable/attainment.

Queens County

Table 8: Annual SO₂ Emissions (tons): Queens County Sources

Facility name	2020*	2021*	2022*	2023*
Ravenswood Generating Station	5.41	14.05	24.81	18.92
Astoria Energy LLC	12.15	12.99	16.96	17.47
Astoria Generating Station	6.25	16.87	3.15	3.04
County Total (includes emissions from all facilities in the county)	43.29	69.21	64.50	50.13

*Source: Certified actual annual non-exempt emissions reported by each facility pursuant to 6 NYCRR Subpart 202-2, "Emission Statements." All 2023 Emission Statements for Queens County are Technically Complete except DECID 2-6304-00404. For the purposes of this report, emissions were assumed to remain constant at 0.1 tons.

SO₂ emissions from Ravenswood Generating Station has fluctuated in the last four years due to economics and variations in how much they are called on to operate during the year. The other major facility in Queens County, Astoria Energy LLC, has seen a slow, steady increase in SO₂ emissions as the facility is called on to operate more and more, burning primarily natural gas and distillate fuel oil.

EPA designated Queens County as "unclassifiable/attainment" based on DEC's "Revised Designation Recommendation for Sulfur Dioxide; Statewide (With the Exception of Erie, Niagara, Seneca, St. Lawrence and Tompkins Counties); 2010 Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard; January 2017" that included dispersion modeling based on county-wide SO₂ emissions of 349 tons in 2013; 1,281 tons in 2014; and 254 tons in 2015.

Total annual SO₂ emissions in Queens County continue to trend downward and annual SO₂ emissions in 2023 were 88% less than the three-year average of emissions (413.02 tons) used by EPA to designate the county as unclassifiable/attainment.

Consequently, additional modeling is not needed to characterize air quality in Queens County to determine whether the area meets or does not meet the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS.

Richmond County

Table 9: Annual SO₂ Emissions (tons): Richmond County Sources

Facility name	2020*	2021*	2022*	2023*
No facilities emitted greater than 40 tons per year in 2023	-	-	-	-
County Total (includes emissions from all facilities in the county)	4.41	4.76	3.85	4.22

*Source: Certified actual annual non-exempt emissions reported by each facility pursuant to 6 NYCRR Subpart 202-2, "Emission Statements." All 2023 Emission Statements for Richmond County are Technically Complete.

There were no facilities in Richmond County in 2023 that are expected to contribute to or cause SO₂ nonattainment in the future.

EPA designated Richmond County as "unclassifiable/attainment" based on DEC's "Revised Designation Recommendation for Sulfur Dioxide; Statewide (With the Exception of Erie, Niagara, Seneca, St. Lawrence and Tompkins Counties); 2010 Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard; January 2017" that included dispersion modeling based on county-wide SO₂ emissions of 6 tons in 2013; 5 tons in 2014; and 5 tons in 2015.

Total annual SO₂ emissions in Richmond County have remained stable and show a 19% decrease from the three-year average of emissions (5.21 tons) used by EPA to designate the county as unclassifiable/attainment.

Consequently, additional modeling is not needed to characterize air quality in Richmond County to determine whether the area meets or does not meet the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS.

Suffolk County

Table 10: Annual SO₂ Emissions (tons): Suffolk County Sources

Facility name	2020*	2021*	2022*	2023*
Northport Power Station	58.08	975.53	994.41	116.55
Port Jefferson Power Station	59.73	135.54	253.97	37.33
Brookhaven Landfill Cell 6	82.64	87.53	34.41	26.23
County Total (includes emissions from all facilities in the county)	273.38	1,273.79	1,359.41	245.72

*Source: Certified actual annual non-exempt emissions reported by each facility pursuant to 6 NYCRR Subpart 202-2, "Emission Statements." All 2023 Emission Statements for Suffolk County are Technically Complete.

From 2021 to 2022, Northport Power emissions increased slightly as the facility continues to burn large amounts of fuel oil in addition to natural gas. This is due to annual variability in electricity demand as well as economic availability of fuel.

Overall fuel use at Northport decreased greatly in 2023 compared to 2022. Natural gas was down from 28.2 billion cubic feet to 20 billion cubic feet. Fuel oil use was down from 25 million gallons to 3 million gallons.

EPA designated Suffolk County as "unclassifiable/attainment" based on DEC's "Revised Designation Recommendation for Sulfur Dioxide; Statewide (With the Exception of Erie, Niagara, Seneca, St. Lawrence and Tompkins Counties); 2010 Primary National Ambient Air Quality Standard; January 2017" that included dispersion modeling based on Northport Power Station SO₂ emissions of 894 tons in 2013; 1,693 tons in 2014; and 1,589 tons in 2015.

Total annual SO₂ emissions in Suffolk County decreased significantly in 2023 and, annual SO₂ emissions are 87% less than the three-year average of emissions (1,962.79 tons) used by EPA to designate the county as unclassifiable/attainment.

Consequently, additional modeling is not needed to characterize air quality in Suffolk County to determine whether the area meets or does not meet the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS.

Monitoring Data

SO₂ design values for monitors in and closest to Albany, Bronx, Erie, Kings, New York, Niagara, Orange, Queens, Richmond, and Suffolk Counties are presented in Table 11. All design values are at least 81 percent below the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS of 75 ppb.

Table 11: SO₂ Design Values (2016 – 2023)

Monitor	County	EPA AQS Site ID	SO ₂ Design Values (ppb)							
			2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023
Holtsville	Suffolk	361030009	7	4	4	4	4	*	*	*
Queens College 2	Queens	360810124	9	7	6	5	6	6	6	5
Botanical Garden (Harding Lab/Pfizer Lab)	Bronx	360050133	11	8	6	5	5	4	4	4
IS 52	Bronx	360050110	11	8	6	6	5	4	4	4
Mt. Ninham	Putnam	360790005	5	5	4	4	2	1	**	**
Millbrook	Dutchess	360270007	4	3	2	2	2	1	**	**
Loudonville	Albany	360010012	6	5	3	3	2	2	**	**
Pinnacle State Park	Steuben	361010003	8	5	3	2	2	1	1	1
Rochester	Monroe	360551007	22	21	18	10	4	2	2	2
Buffalo	Erie	360290005	9	9	7	10	12	14	11	6
Brookside Terrace (Tonawanda II)	Erie	360291014	20	13	9	4	3	3	6	6

Source for 2015-2022 Design Values: EPA AQS "Sulfur Dioxide Design Values, 2022 (XSLX) 05/24/2023" generated on September 11, 2023 from <https://www.epa.gov/air-trends/air-quality-design-values#report>.

* Monitor shut down on January 1, 2021.

** Monitor shut down on January 1, 2022.

Recommendation

In consideration of the emissions and monitoring data contained in this report, DEC concludes that Albany, Bronx, Erie, Kings, New York, Niagara, Orange, Queens, Richmond, and Suffolk Counties continue to attain the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS by a significant margin and that EPA does not need to take any action pursuant to 40 CFR 51.1205(d).

Conclusion

This report satisfies the requirements of 40 CFR 51.1205(b) for 2024 for Albany, Bronx, Erie, Kings, New York, Niagara, Orange, Richmond, Queens, and Suffolk Counties.



ENB PUBLISH DATE: 11/13/2024

Statewide - 40 CFR 51.1205(b) Report; Albany, Bronx, Erie, Kings, New York, Niagara, Orange, Queens, Richmond, and Suffolk Counties; 2010 Sulfur Dioxide National Ambient Air Quality Standard; November 2024

[Home](#) </> > [News](#) </news> > [Environmental Notice Bulletin](#) </news/environmental-notice-bulletin> > [Statewide - 40 CFR 51.1205\(...\)](#)

Public Notice

40 CFR 51.1205(b) Report; Albany, Bronx, Erie, Kings, New York, Niagara, Orange, Queens, Richmond, and Suffolk Counties; 2010 Sulfur Dioxide National Ambient Air Quality Standard; November 2024

Notice is hereby given that the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (NYS DEC) plans to submit the above referenced report to the United States Environmental Protection Agency (US EPA) and is providing a 30 day period for the public to comment on the proposed report.

On June 2, 2010, the US EPA strengthened the primary (health based) sulfur dioxide (SO₂) National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS) by establishing a new 1-hour standard at a level of 75 parts per billion (ppb).

The US EPA finalized the second round of designations for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS on July 12, 2016. In that final rule, the US EPA designated the New York counties of Erie and Niagara as "unclassifiable/attainment" for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS based on an assessment and characterization of air quality performed using air dispersion modeling software, i.e., AERMOD, that analyzed actual emissions in the area surrounding Huntley (Erie County) and Somerset (Niagara

County) generating stations, as well as other nearby sources which may have a potential impact in the area of analysis where maximum concentrations of SO₂ are expected.

The US EPA finalized the third round of designations for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS on January 1, 2018. In that final rule, the US EPA designated the New York counties of Albany, Orange, Suffolk, New York, Queens, Kings, Bronx, and Richmond as "unclassifiable/attainment" for the 2010 primary SO₂ NAAQS based on an assessment and characterization of air quality in the area surrounding Lafarge Building Materials (Albany County), Roseton Generating Station (Orange County), Northport Power Station (Suffolk County), and several power stations in the New York City area.

Pursuant to 40 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) 51.1205(b), "[f]or any area where modeling of actual SO₂ emissions serve as the basis for designating such area as attainment for the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS, the air agency shall submit an annual report to the US EPA Regional Administrator ... that documents the annual SO₂ emissions of each applicable source in each such area and provides an assessment of the cause of any emissions increase from the previous year."

NYS DEC plans to submit "40 CFR 51.1205(b) Report; Albany, Bronx, Erie, Kings, New York, Niagara, Orange, Queens, Richmond, and Suffolk Counties; 2010 Sulfur Dioxide National Ambient Air Quality Standard; November 2024" to the US EPA. The final report satisfies the requirements of 40 CFR 51.1205(b) for 2024 by demonstrating that all counties included in the report continue to attain the 2010 SO₂ NAAQS by a significant margin and that no additional air quality modeling is needed. The proposed report <<https://dec.ny.gov/environmental-protection/air-quality/plans>> can be requested from the contact listed below and on-line at: <https://dec.ny.gov/environmental-protection/air-quality/plans> <<https://dec.ny.gov/environmental-protection/air-quality/plans>>

Written comments should be submitted by 5:00 p.m. on December 13, 2024, to the contact listed below.

Primary Contact

Daniel Goss
NYS DEC - Division of Air Resources
625 Broadway,
Albany, NY 12233-3251

Phone: (518) 402-8396
dar.sips@dec.ny.gov

This Page Covers

New York State